

THE RESURRECTION MOTIF IN THE HEBREW BIBLE: ALLUSIONS OR ILLUSIONS?

LEILA LEAH BRONNER

From the beginning of civilization, people have made great efforts to pierce the veil of death and discover what lies beyond this life. Most scholars have maintained that the concept of resurrection was unknown in the early books of the Hebrew Bible. We question the assumption that resurrection was not expressed until the very late post-exilic age. In light of information flowing from archeological, historical, linguistic, and philological research, some scholars now maintain that there is evidence of a belief in the afterlife in pre-exilic books of the Hebrew Bible.¹ The aim of this paper is to investigate resurrection motifs detected in the early portions of the Bible prior to the Book of Daniel.

We argue that the clear expression of a belief in bodily resurrection as described in Daniel (12:2-4), dated by critical scholarship to the Second Century BCE, could not have emerged spontaneously without significant precursors. Rather, we believe that the concept of resurrection most probably and logically developed out of generations of speculation about what lies beyond death. We also consider whether foreign influences informed the Israelites' belief in the afterlife, and if so, to what extent.²

Our methodology is to analyze relevant biblical texts which pre-date Daniel, and to focus especially on the philological significance of five main verbs in their context which have been identified as possible signifiers of resurrection language: *hayah* [live], *qum* [stand up], *hekitz* [wake up], *shuv* [come back], and *tzitz* [sprout forth].³ The verbs *qum* and *hayah* appear in several different contexts in the Bible, but when *qum* appears paired and parallel with *hayah*, the combination strongly suggests, from the semantic nuances and syntactical dimensions, that the resurrection motif is present. Thus, these verbs may not always refer directly to resurrection but acquire

Leila Leah Bronner, Litt.D., formerly a professor at the University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, and the University of Judaism, Los Angeles, has published many books and articles, most recently From Eve to Esther: Rabbinic Reconstructions of Biblical Women (Westminster: John Knox, 1994).

these meanings contextually. The rabbinic phrase for resurrection "*tehiyyat ha-metim*" does not appear in the Bible.⁴

We will ascertain, from historical and sociological setting, whether the particular verbs refer to illness and healing or to actual death and resurrection. At another level, we will attempt to discover whether the references to resurrection were expressed in a metaphorical sense, indicating the restoration of the nation as a whole, or in a literal sense, referring to the revival of the individual.

"Resurrection" is defined as the belief that in the future the dead will rise from their graves, bringing about a revival of the whole person, body and soul.⁵ From a theological standpoint, in the Hebrew Bible, resurrection stems from the belief that God has unlimited power, and thus represents the ultimate force behind history and natural phenomena. How did Israelite thinking differ from the beliefs of surrounding cultures? In contrast to the Canaanite Baal, who was believed to die and be reborn, the God of Israel is described as *the living God* (Josh. 3:10; Ps. 42:3; 84:3; Dan. 6:21, 27), representing a constant presence above the cycles of nature. As the psalmist proclaims: *If I ascend to heaven, there You are; if I descend to Sheol, You are there too* (Ps. 139:8).

Supposedly, upon death, one descended to the abyss in the depths of the earth, called Sheol, described as the underworld abode where the dead were gathered to their kin [*vaye'asef*] or were described as "lying with one's ancestors" [*shachav im avotav*] in a shadowy afterlife. Although one cannot speak of a philosophical conception of the afterlife as being present in Sheol, there is nevertheless found here a simple unsophisticated perception of existence continuing after the physical body is laid to rest in the family tomb.⁶ This belief in a shadowy continuation of life demonstrates an evolving understanding of life after death. There are over 60 references to Sheol, indicating a great concern for the welfare of the dead.⁷

Where do we find passages in the Bible which offer symbols and images of resurrection as proposed above? We now focus on several such examples: The Songs of Moses and Hannah, the narratives of Elijah and Elisha, the books of Psalms, Hosea, Isaiah, and Ezekiel, all of which pre-date Daniel.

RESURRECTION MOTIF IN THE HEBREW BIBLE

THE SONG OF MOSES AND THE SONG OF HANNAH

The word order in both the Song of Moses (Deut. 32:39) and the Song of Hannah (I Sam 2:6), dated quite early, is striking.⁸ The arrangement of the key words – with death first followed by life – in both these passages suggests that they are dealing with a resurrection motif:

I deal death and give life;

I wound and I will heal;

None can deliver from My hand (Deut. 32:39).

The theme of the all-powerful might of God is further embellished in the Song of Hannah, where the word order is in the same pattern; death first, then life.

The Lord deals death and gives life

Casts down into the Sheol and raises up (I Sam. 2:6).

To "deal death" first and then "give life," rather than vice versa, points to a time after the earthly life of the body, and also confirms the power of God who can reverse the fortunes of the dead by infusing them with the vitality of life.⁹ These songs allude to the resurrection motif but do not elaborate in detail on the process. In Sanhedrin 91b the rabbis' interest was also piqued by the verse in Deuteronomy 32:39 *I deal death and make alive*, which they cited to strengthen their argument that resurrection [*tehiyyat ha-metim*] is indeed intimated in the Torah.

ELIJAH AND ELISHA

The Elijah and Elisha narratives in I and II Kings are set in the Northern Kingdom of Israel in the Ninth Century BCE. While these prophetic narratives differ in linguistic structure and style from the previous songs, they too offer evidence of resurrection, but in a different form: not at the end of days, but immediately upon death.¹⁰

A unique aspect of these two prophets is their ability to perform miraculous acts, which include praying to God to revive children who have died. Why did these stories appear during the lifetimes of Elijah and Elisha particularly in this time and place? Neighboring cultures attributed the power of giving life and death to the pagan god Baal and goddess Anat as described in the Ugaritic texts. Anat promises eternal life to Aqht who mockingly expresses

doubt in her ability to do this. She responds angrily by killing him, although it is suggested that she eventually revives him.

And the maiden Anat replied:

Ask for life O Aqht the youth,

Ask for life and I will give it to you,

For deathlessness and I will bestow it on thee.

I'll make thee count years with Baal.

With sons of El shalt thou count months.

Even as Baal when he gives life,

Entertains the living...

So also I will give life to Aqht the youth.¹¹

Likewise the children of King Krt exclaim:

In your life O our father we rejoice,

Your immortality – we are glad therein.¹²

The author of the stories of Elijah and Elisha was well acquainted with the belief that prevailed in Ugarit that Baal, who died and was resurrected, could also resuscitate.¹³ It is very possible that these prophets felt pressure of the environment to demonstrate that the God of Israel has the power to control life and death. Their stories provide a polemic against the influence of Baal worship.

The first dramatic story presenting the physical revival of a child by the prophet Elijah is set in the context of strife and famine in the days of King Ahab. Elijah, having antagonized the royal court with his moral chastisement, is forced to flee, and finds refuge at the home of the poor widow of Zarephath whose child falls sick until there is no longer any breath/soul [*neshama*] remaining in him (I Kg. 17:17). After Elijah prays fervently to God, the soul of the child does return to him, and, as it is written, *he revived* [*vayehi*]. The prophet then said to the woman '*See, your child lives* [*hai*]' (17:22).

Elijah's disciple Elisha is also the Divine instrument of bringing a youth back from death. Elisha prophesies that a barren Shunammite woman who had given him hospitality would bear a child. The prophecy is fulfilled, and she does bear a son, who later dies. The distraught woman rushes to Elisha, who miraculously revives the child (II Kg. 4:34-37).

The death scenes of both Elijah and his successor Elisha portray images of resurrection. At the end of Elijah's earthly life's journey, the prophet ascends

RESURRECTION MOTIF IN THE HEBREW BIBLE

to heaven in a chariot of fire. The disciples of the prophet inform Elisha that his master Elijah will be "taken" away. The verb "*lakach*" [take] is featured in this description, alluding to ascension to heaven. The mantle of prophecy, along with the power of revival, are thereafter transferred to his disciple Elisha. A miraculous scene demonstrating Elisha's powers even after his death occurs when his body causes the revival of a dead man who is thrown into the prophet's sepulchre. When the corpse of the dead man touches the prophet's body, *the [dead] man revived [vayehi] and stood on his feet [vayakom 'al raglav]* (II Kg. 13:21).¹⁴

The verb "*lakach*" appears together with the paired resurrection verbs "*hayah*" and "*qum*" in the Elijah cycle, where it takes on a unique mystical connotation. The Bible knows of only one other ascension besides Elijah's; that of Enoch (Gen. 5:23-24), who was said to have walked with and been taken [*lakach*] by God. The word *lakach* also appears in Psalms, where it resonates with overtones of resurrection.

PSALMS

There are two psalms in which the verb "*lakach*" is utilized to express the pious person's hope for the reward of eternal life in God's presence. In Psalms 49 and 73, part of the genre known as Wisdom Psalms, the author reflects upon the problem of why it can happen that the wicked prosper and the righteous can suffer, as well as the problem of the transitory nature of human life. *But God will redeem my life [or: soul] from the clutches of the Sheol, for He will take [lakach] me* (49:16).

Psalms 73 likewise speaks of the pious being taken [*lakach*] to enjoy nearness to God's presence.¹⁵

Nevertheless I am constantly with You:

You hold my right hand.

You will guide me with your counsel

And afterward take [lakach] me with glory (73: 23-24).

The verb "*lakach*" appears in both psalms, suggesting that, as in the case of Elijah and Enoch, God will take the pious to everlasting life in heaven. The message of these two psalms concludes that the just man who places his confidence in God rather than in material values of this world will be "taken" into the company of God and live forever.

HOSEA

Hosea prophesied in the Northern Kingdom of Israel around the mid-Eighth Century, following the death of Jeroboam II and up to the fall of Samaria.

This

prophet might have known about the activities attributed to Elijah and Elisha concerning resurrection. Hosea's prophecies are set against a backdrop of social, moral, and religious decadence coupled with political instability. The prophet castigates Israel for the syncretic practice of worshipping God together with Baal and Canaanite fertility cults. Was the Israelite concept of resurrection also influenced by the Canaanite ritual centered on the cycle of dying and rising gods?

Scholars once maintained that foreign influences emanating in particular from Babylonian, Persian and Canaanite-Ugaritic cultic beliefs influenced the Israelites' belief in the afterlife.¹⁶ Current research, however, tends to conclude that foreign practices might not have had a decisive impact on the Israelites' specific understandings of resurrection, our topic under discussion. For example, the death and resurrection of the nature god Baal does not appear to explain the biblical concept of God's awakening mortals to new life after death. As Andersen writes ". . . the death and resurrection of people has nothing in common with a myth in which a god dies and comes back to life."¹⁷ Furthermore, according to Gillman, ". . . it is conceivable that there was no cultural borrowing here at all, but rather that the idea of resurrection evolved within Israel as a thoroughly natural development of ideas deeply planted in biblical religion from the outset."¹⁸

Verses in Hosea feature several of the verbs previously indicated as signaling the resurrection motif:

Come, let us turn back [shuv] to God:

He has stricken, and He can heal us;

He wounded, and He can bind us up.

After two days days he will revive us [hayah]

On the third day He will raise us up [qum]

That we may live [hayah] in his presence

And He shall come to us as rain

As the latter rain that waters the earth (Hos. 6:1-3).

The first verse describes the people begging to be healed by God from their wounded state. The request in the second verse intensifies when the paired verbs *hayah* and *qum* appear, depicting the people asking not only to be healed but also to be revived to new life.

Some scholars had maintained that the significance of "two days" and "three days" displays the influence of the Baal agriculture worship, relating to the god dying and rising from the underworld. Current scholarship, however, indicates that the numbers merely refer to raising up, which will happen soon or in a very short time without much trouble. "Two or three days" might be an artistic, poetic device rather than a strict time schedule.¹⁹

Scholars have differing opinions whether the verb roots *hayah* and *qum* in Hosea 6:3 refer to relief from suffering or to actual physical resurrection after death. Stamm maintains that the *piel* form of the verb *hayah* does not mean "to live again" but "to recover health," and the *hiphil* form of "*qum*" means "to rise from a bed" and not "to be raised to life." He thus concludes that Israel is awaiting healing and not resurrection.²⁰

Mauchline also grapples with the problem of whether this is language of healing and renewal or revival from death, but comes to a different conclusion. He writes: "The words in verse 2 'He will revive us' seem to speak of a revival after death."²¹ Spronk believes that Hosea 6:1-3 is derived from the belief in real liberation from the world of the dead as part of a cyclical conception of beatific afterlife, and does not refer only to healing from sickness.²² Andersen also opts for the resurrection motif: "Verse 2 opens and closes with the statements 'He will make us live and we shall live.' Explicit hope for resurrection of the body can hardly be denied in this passage, but commentators have been reluctant to admit it." Andersen refers to a later verse on a similar theme: '*I will ransom them from the power of the grave [Sheol] and I will redeem them from death*' (Hos. 13:14). He further states: ". . . there lies a picture of death and resurrection [in Hosea] which is widely accepted though not a part of a major dogmatic tradition."²³

All the above evidence suggests that Hosea's imagery is not merely metaphorical. It could indeed refer not only to national revival but also to a person's individual, physical resurrection. These comments quoted above by recent scholars bear witness to a shift in attitude, and indicate that they too accept the possibility of resurrection in Hosea.

EZEKIEL

The allusions to death and resurrection in the poetic writings of Hosea are less detailed than the graphic prose descriptions in Ezekiel. The destruction that had been foreseen had become a terrible reality. Ezekiel lived through the greatest crises in ancient Israel's history: The destruction of the First Temple, the ruin of its capital Jerusalem, the loss of independence of Judah, and exile of the leading citizens to Babylon (597–586). Each of these losses had historical, political and theological ramifications. Not only were the people's physical lives disrupted, but their faith was shaken as well. The suffering people cried out in their own defense and challenged the justness of the belief that the iniquities of the fathers are visited unto the children (Jer. 31:29; Ezek. 18:2). The prophet Ezekiel agreed that the person alone should suffer for individual sins, and not pay the price for the entire nation.

In his apocalyptic vision of the valley of the dry bones, the prophet responds to the people's despair and, in a hopeful prophecy of the dry bones coming back to life, predicts national restoration. The prophet speaks directly to the bones, and delivers the powerful word of God:

O dry bones, hear the word of God.

Thus says the Lord God to these bones,

'Behold, I will cause breath to enter you, and you shall live [hayah]'

(Ezek. 37:4-5).

This imagery of resurrection could be not only a metaphor of revival of the collective body of the Israel but also a graphic image of bodily resurrection.

'And I will lay sinews upon you and will bring up flesh upon you, and cover you with skin, and put breath in you, and you shall live; and you shall know that I am the Lord' (37:6)

The key word "*hayah*," appearing five times in 37:1-14, alerts the reader to the theme of resurrection. Although we do not find the expected paired word "*qum*" [rise], the synonym "*amad*" [stand or rise] does appear in 37:10. In the vision we find all the physical elements necessary for reconstructing the human body: Bones, flesh, sinews, spirit, and the breath of life. It is not doubted that those scholars who interpret Ezekiel's vision as providing hope for a national restoration are correct, but the vision also embodies a expanded

dimension of physical revival for the individual at a time when the wish for personal vindication was developing.

ISAIAH (24-27)

Another section of the Bible which speaks of the resurrection of the dead is Isaiah 24-27, known as the "Isaiah Apocalypse." Biblical scholars were divided on the dating, placing them as early as the Eighth Century to as late as the Third Century. More recent scholarship, however, favors the Sixth Century,²⁴ in the historical setting when the people of Judah were faced with national destruction and dispersion by the Babylonian conquest. The national trauma led many conquered Jews who were innocent of wrongdoing to question God's justice. Resurrection would then promise them vindication for their suffering and would reaffirm God's power in bringing the righteous back to life. If the Sixth Century is the date for the Isaiah Apocalypse, which we believe it is, it would show that the belief in resurrection was already in evidence before Daniel, as our discussion of Hosea and Ezekiel suggests.

The Isaiah Apocalypse clearly proclaims the resurrection of the dead, stating that those who lie in the dust of the earth will arise and shout with joy:

Oh, let Your dead revive [hayah]!

Let corpses [neveilati] arise [qum]!

Awake [hekitz] and shout for joy,

You who dwell in the dust!

For Your dew is like the dew on fresh growth;

You make the land of the shades [refa'im] come to life (26:19).

Modern scholars have offered varying interpretations for the etymology of the word "shades" [*refa'im*]. We limit our etymological analysis by interpreting that the shades in 26:14 refer to the wicked leaders who will not be revived after death, while the shades in 26:19 allude to the pious who will be healed, thrown out from the netherworld, and resurrected by the intervention of God.²⁵

Another striking motif of rebirth in 26:19 draws from the imagery of nature *You who dwell in the dust! For Your dew is like the dew on fresh growth; You make the earth cast out the shades.* As dew brings life to the parched vegetation, so God will give new life through the dew, as it falls on the graves of God's people. According to the consensus of exegetical opinion, Isaiah 26:19

expresses in most graphic language the hope for a literal resurrection, that the faithful dead shall live again.

The nature imagery of the dew reviving the dead is reminiscent of the vocabulary and language of nature worship familiar from the surrounding cultures. However, in the Isaiah context, it is the image of the life-giving power of God that resurrects the dead, as the morning dew revives the flowers after a night of darkness. Hosea 6:3, quoted above, and Hosea 14:5-6 contain a similar theme of God's control of the life-giving power of moisture to revive the dead.

DANIEL

The imagery of the Isaiah Apocalypse is expanded in the Book of Daniel, which contains the most developed description in the Bible of the awakening and the judgment of the dead:

Many of those that sleep in the dust of the earth will awake, some to eternal life, others to shame, to everlasting abhorrence (12:2).

The linkage of the verbs "*hayah*" "*qum*" and "*hekitz*," in Daniel now appears as significant evidence of a long tradition of conceptualizing resurrection. What seems like a sudden bursting into bloom is actually a flowering, nourished from deeper roots buried in the soil of earlier biblical writings. Whereas Isaiah views resurrection as a reward for the righteous who arise and sing, Daniel proclaims that both the righteous and their persecutors will awake and arise, but the former for reward and eternal life; the latter for *de-ra'on* [shame and punishment].²⁶

The Book of Daniel was intended to offer hope and consolation to Jews suffering from oppression by the ruling monarch. Those who date the texts to the Second Century identify him as the Syrian King Antiochus Epiphanes. It was a difficult conflict for the pious Jews who, although observing God's law, were being punished even to martyrdom. The unjust persecution may have led them to intensify their search for a belief that the martyrs who died fighting for their religion would be rewarded by God with resurrection, while their oppressors would be punished with abiding perdition.²⁷ Daniel incorporates familiar themes of resurrection from earlier biblical texts, and goes significantly beyond them. In post-biblical rabbinic Judaism and in early Christiani-

ty, Daniel 12 would form the basis for much further elaboration for a belief in resurrection. A detailed discussion of these later sources falls outside the scope of this paper.

CONCLUSION

While scholars have claimed that the first clear evidence of a belief in resurrection is only to be found in the Book of Daniel, we demonstrated that the author of the Book of Daniel may have drawn on antecedents from earlier biblical texts, ranging from hinted images to vivid descriptions. We noted that diverse expressions of the resurrection motif were already present as early as the Ninth and Eighth Centuries, becoming increasingly explicit and more fully developed beginning in the exilic period of the Sixth Century.

NOTES

1. Contradictory opinions still prevail about this subject. Among the scholars who question whether such a belief existed prior to the Book of Daniel are Robert Martin-Achard, *From Death to Life* (London: Oliver and Boyd, 1960) pp. 189ff; Lloyd R Bailey, Sr., *Biblical Perspectives on Death* (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1979) p. 4; *The Anchor Bible Dictionary*, Vol. 2 (New York: Doubleday, 1992) pp. 108-110, et al. The following do find evidence of resurrection language in the Hebrew Bible: Mitchell Dahood, *Psalms I* (New York: Doubleday, 1965), *Psalms II* (1968) and *Psalms III* (1970); Leonard J. Greenspoon, "The Origin of the Idea of Resurrection," in Baruch Halpern and Jon D. Levenson, *Traditions in Transformation: Turning Points in Biblical Faith* (Winona Lake, Indiana: Eisenbrauns, 1981) pp. 310-311; Francis I. Andersen and David Noel Freedman, eds., *Hosea*, Anchor Bible Series, Vol. 24 (New York: Doubleday, 1980) pp. 420-421.
2. While there has been extensive research on the related subjects of burial practices and archeological inscriptions from gravesites from Ugaritic, Canaanite, and Israelite sources, those studies are beyond the scope of this paper. T. J. Lewis, *Cults of the Dead in Ancient Israel and Ugarit*, Harvard Semitic Monographs (Atlanta: Scholars Press, 1989), I. Singer, *Graves and Burial Practices in Israel in the Ancient Period* (Jerusalem: Israel Exploration Society, 1994) [Hebrew].
3. John Sawyer, "Hebrew Words for the Resurrection of the Dead," *Vetus Testamentum* 23 (1973) pp. 218-34.
4. The phrase "*tehiyyat ha-metim*" occurs 4 times in the Mishnah and 41 times in the Talmud. Chaim J. Kasowsky, *Thesaurus on Mishnah*, Vol. 1 (1957) p. 689; *Thesaurus on Talmud*, Vol. 13 (1964) p. 382. See also, Harry Sysling, *Tehiyyat Ha-Metim*, (Tubingen: J.C.B Mohr, 1996) p. 1; John Pedersen, *Israel, Its Life and Culture*, Vol. 1 (Copenhagen: 1964) pp. 104, 180.
5. While the term "immortality" is often used interchangeably with "resurrection," there is a marked difference. Immortality stresses a dualism in which the body is destructible, whereas the soul has eternal life.

6. S. P. Raphael, *Jewish Views of the Afterlife* (Northvale, NJ: Jason Aronson Inc., 1996) pp. 47-48.
7. For a more detailed description of Sheol, see Nicholas Tromp, *Primitive Conceptions of Death and the Nether World in the Old Testament* (Rome: Pontifical Biblical Institute 1969) p. 21.
8. According to various scholars, the origin of the Song of Moses can be dated anywhere from the Late Bronze Age Thirteenth Century to the exilic Sixth Century. The dating of the Song of Hannah could be anywhere between the Eleventh and Ninth Centuries. See: Greenspoon, pp. 310-311. Both the dating of the events described and the writing of the books are subject to much debate. See B. C. Pryce, *The Resurrection Motif in Hosea 5:8-6:6, An Exegetical Study*, Ph.D. diss., Andrews University, 1989, pp. 276-277.
9. Achard, pp. 52 –57.
10. These prophetic stories are placed historically in the Ninth Century according to the interaction with the kings of the Northern Kingdom, and were probably put into written form by the Deuteronomist in the Seventh Century.
11. Aqht VI, 25-33, in Cyrus Gordon, *Analecta Orientalia 38: Ugaritic Textbook* (Rome: Pontificium Institutum Biblicum, 1965).
12. Krt, 125, 98,99, in Gordon.
13. Leah Bronner, *The Stories of Elijah and Elisha as Polemics Against Baal Worship* (Leiden: Brill, 1968) pp. 106 ff.
14. I Samuel 28:12-24 is a fascinating story of the witch of Endor raising up the prophet Samuel for a short communication with King Saul, after which the prophet returns to Sheol. See also, verses that inveigh against necromancy, Leviticus 19:31, Deuteronomy 18:11, Isaiah 18:19.
15. See Psalm 16:9: "For Thou dost not give me up to Sheol, or let Thy godly one see the Pit" See also Psalm 17.5. Though they do not use "lakach," they present a similar theme of a reward of nearness of God, and avoiding Sheol.
16. See James Pritchard, ed., *Ancient Near Eastern Texts Relating to the Old Testament* (ANET) (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1955) p. 437; Achard, pp. 83-85 on influence of agricultural cults and pp. 188-9 on influence of Persian Zoroastrian religion.
17. See Andersen and Freedman, p. 420.
18. Neil Gillman, *The Death of Death: Resurrection and Immortality in Jewish Thought* (Woodstock, Vermont: Jewish Lights Publishing, 1997) p. 96.
19. William Harper, *The International Critical Commentary, A Critical and Exegetical Commentary on Amos and Hosea* (Edinburgh: Clark, 1910) p. 283.
20. Achard, pp. 80-86; Pryce, p.4 on pre-1960s studies which on the whole do not accept the idea of resurrection but rather interpret as healing.
21. John Mauchline, *Book of Hosea, The Interpreter's Bible*, Vol. 6 (Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1956) p. 625.
22. Klaas Spronk, *Beatific Afterlife in Ancient Israel and in the Ancient Near East* (Germany: Neukirchener Verlag Neukirchen-Vluyn, 1986) p. 276.
23. Andersen and Freedman, pp. 420-21 and Pryce, p. 31 for other scholars since the 1960s who agree with some form of the resurrection theme.
24. For a detailed discussion of the content and structure of the Isaiah Apocalypse see Yehezkel Kaufmann, *Toledot ha-Emunah ha-Yisraelit*, Vol. 3 (1) pp. 186 ff; Edward Kissane, *The Book of Isaiah* (Dublin: Browne and Nolin, Ltd., 1941) pp. 267, 303; William R. Miller, *Isaiah 24-27*

RESURRECTION MOTIF IN THE HEBREW BIBLE

and the Origin of Apocalyptic (Missoula, Montana: Scholar's Press, 1976); Paul D. Hanson, *The Dawn of Apocalyptic* (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1979) pp. 98 ff.

25. *Encyclopedia Biblica*, Vol 7, (Hebrew) (Jerusalem: Bialik Foundation, 1976) p. 405, s.v. *Refa'im*.

26. The word "*dera'on*" occurs only twice in the Hebrew Bible (Isa. 66:24; Dan. 12:2), each time in a context implying abhorrence and damnation.

27. See II Maccabees 7 for later reference to persecution of martyrs.