

'I AM A HEBREW!'
JONAH'S CONFLICT WITH GOD'S MERCY
TOWARD EVEN THE MOST WORTHY OF PAGANS

HAYYIM ANGEL

The Book of Jonah's 48 verses continue to be scoured for their fundamental messages. Readers encounter great difficulty in finding a comprehensive theory to explain the purpose of the Book, or why Jonah fled from his mission.

One midrash suggests that unrepentant Israel would look bad were non-Israelites to repent.¹ Another proposes that Jonah was worried about being called a false prophet once his prediction of Nineveh's destruction went unfulfilled.²

Abarbanel [preface to his commentary on Jonah, Second Question] does not find either answer persuasive. Perhaps Israel would be inspired to repent in light of Nineveh's repentance; Israel would not look bad in contrast. Moreover, since the Ninevites did repent, they obviously believed Jonah to be a true prophet. Nowhere in the Book is there evidence of Jonah's being upset about his or Israel's reputation. It is unlikely that Jonah would have violated God's commandment for the reasons given by these midrashim.

Abarbanel (followed by Malbim) submits that Jonah feared the future destruction of Israel by Assyria. Rather than obey God's directive, Jonah elected to martyr himself on behalf of his people. However, the Book of Jonah portrays Nineveh as a typological Sodom-like city-state, not as the historical capital of Assyria. Jonah's name appears 18 times in the Book, but nobody else – not even the king of Nineveh – is named. Additionally, there is no mention of Israel or its king in the story. Like the Book of Job, the Book of Jonah appears to have a self-contained message that transcends its historical context.³

Seeking another approach, Yehoshua Bachrach,⁴ Elyakim Ben-Menahe⁵, and Uriel Simon⁶ cite a passage from the Jerusalem Talmud:

Hayyim Angel is Associate Rabbi at Congregation Shearith Israel of New York City (the Spanish-Portuguese Synagogue, founded in 1654) and teaches Tanakh at Yeshiva University. He has published articles on Tanakh in journals such as Tradition, Nahalah, Jewish Thought, Or HaMizrah, and in several collections of essays.

It was asked of wisdom: what is the punishment for a sinner? She replied, *Misfortune pursues sinners* (Prov. 13:21). It was asked of prophecy: what is the punishment for a sinner? She replied, *The person who sins, only he shall die* (Ezek. 18:4, 20). It was asked of God: what is the punishment for a sinner? He replied, let him repent and gain atonement (J.T. *Makkot* 2:6 [31d]).

From this point of view, there is a fundamental struggle between God and prophecy. Jonah the prophet protested the very existence of repentance, preferring instead that God mete out immediate punishment for sinners.

While this approach is more comprehensive in interpreting the Book of Jonah than earlier interpretations, it remains incomplete. Much of the Book has little to do with repentance or God's mercy – particularly Jonah's lengthy encounter with the sailors in Chapter 1 who never needed to repent, and his prayer in Chapter 2 where he likely did not repent. Aside from downplaying the role of the sailors in Chapter 1, Simon sidesteps Jonah's prayer by contending that the psalm was not an original part of the story.⁷ Regardless of its origins, however, Jonah's psalm appears integral to the Book, and actually contains one of the keys to unlocking the overall purposes of the narrative.⁸ Finally, most prophets appear to have accepted the ideas of repentance and God's mercy. Why should Jonah alone have fled his from mission in so dramatic and rebellious a manner?

While these interpreters are correct in stressing Jonah's protest against God's attribute of mercy in 4:2, Jonah also appears to have disapproved of that attribute particularly when God applies it to pagans. It appears that this theme lies at the heart of the Book, creating a painful conflict between Jonah and God. Jonah was unwilling to accept God's mercy even to the most ethically perfected pagans because that manifestation of mercy was antithetical to Jonah's desired conception of God.

CHAPTER 1

Although they were pagans, the sailors in Chapter 1 were superior people. They prayed to their deities during the storm, treated Jonah with respect even after he had been selected by the lottery, and went to remarkable lengths to avoid throwing him overboard even after he confessed. They implored God

for forgiveness. When they finally did throw Jonah into the sea, they made vows to God.

Jonah, on the other hand, actively rebelled against God by fleeing. He slept while the terrified sailors prayed to their deities. Remarkably, the captain sounds like a prophet when addressing Jonah – *'How can you be sleeping so soundly! Up, call upon your god! Perhaps the god will be kind to us and we will not perish'* (1:6) – while Jonah sounds like the inattentive audience a prophet typically must rebuke. When Jonah finally does speak in the text, the narrator divides the prophet's words between a direct quotation and narrative:

'I am a Hebrew! [Ivri anokhi],' he replied. *'I worship the Lord, the God of Heaven, who made both sea and land.'* *The men were greatly terrified, and they asked him, 'What have you done?'* *And when the men learned that he was fleeing from the service of the Lord – for so he told them . . . (1:9-10).*

Although Jonah told the sailors what they wanted to know, that is, that his flight from God had caused the storm, the narrator related those crucial words himself rather than placing them into Jonah's direct speech. Moreover, Jonah's statement, that he was a Hebrew who worshipped the true God, appears tangential to the terrified sailors' concerns. Why would the narrator frame Jonah's statement this way?

The term "*Ivri* [Hebrew]" often is used when contrasting Israelites with non-Israelites.⁹ In this vein, Elyakim Ben-Menahem notes that Jonah's usage of *Ivri* in 1:9 is expected, since he was contrasting himself with pagans. Jonah's perceived dissimilarity to the pagan sailors is the main emphasis of Chapter 1. Ben-Menahem further suggests that the text does not report Jonah's response to the captain so that his dramatic proclamation in 1:9 could appear as his first words recorded in the Book.¹⁰ This contrast with the sailors was most important to Jonah; therefore, the narrator placed only these words in his direct quotation. Attempting to explain the bifurcation of Jonah's statement, Abarbanel advances a midrashic-style comment: "The intent [of the word '*Ivri*'] is not only that he was from the Land of the Hebrews; rather, he was a sinner [*avaryan*] who was transgressing God's commandment."

Abarbanel surmises that the sailors deduced from this wordplay on "*Ivri*" that Jonah was fleeing! For Abarbanel's suggestion to work as the primary meaning of the text, of course, the sailors would have to have known Hebrew

and to have been as ingenious as Abarbanel to have caught that wordplay. Though not a *peshat*-oriented comment, however, Abarbanel's insight is conceptually illuminating regarding the overall purpose of Chapter 1. Jonah emphatically contrasted himself with the pagan sailors, but the narrator has contrasted Jonah with God. In Chapter 1, Jonah was indeed Abarbanel's *Ivri* – a prophetic hero of true faith contrasting himself with pagans, and an *avaryan* – a sinner against God.

CHAPTER 2

After waiting three days inside the fish, Jonah finally prayed to God. Some (for example, Ibn Ezra, Abarbanel and Malbim) conclude that Jonah must have repented, since God ordered the fish to spew Jonah out, and Jonah subsequently went to Nineveh. However, there is no indication of repentance in Jonah's prayer.¹¹ One might argue further that God's decision to enjoin Jonah to return to Nineveh in 3:1-2 indicates that Jonah had indeed not repented.¹² In his prayer, Jonah was more concerned with being saved and serving God in the Temple (2:5, 8).

Jonah concluded his prayer with two triumphant verses: *They who cling to empty folly forsake their own welfare, but I, with loud thanksgiving, will sacrifice to You; what I have vowed I will perform. Deliverance is the Lord's!* (2:9-10). Ibn Ezra and Radak believe that Jonah was contrasting himself with the sailors who had made vows in 1:16. Unlike their insincere (in Jonah's opinion) vows, Jonah intended to keep his faithfully. Abarbanel and Malbim, however, do not think that Jonah would allude to the sailors, who are only tangential to their understanding of the story. Instead, they maintain that Jonah was forecasting the insincere (in Jonah's opinion) repentance of the Ninevites.

One may combine the foregoing opinions: the sailors and Ninevites both are central to the Book of Jonah, each receiving a chapter of coverage. They were superior people – the sailors all along, and the Ninevites after their repentance, but Jonah despised them because they were pagans. Thus, Jonah's prayer ties the episodes with the sailors and Ninevites together, creating a unified theme for the Book.

It seems that Rashi has the smoothest reading: *They who cling to empty folly*: those who worship idols; *forsake their own welfare*: their fear of God,

from whom all kindness emanates. *But I*, in contrast, am not like this; I, *with loud thanksgiving, will sacrifice to You* (Rashi on Jon. 2:9-10).

As in Chapter 1, Jonah's contrasting himself with pagans is the climactic theme of his prayer in Chapter 2. To paraphrase the prayer in Chapter 2, Jonah was saying "*Ivri anokhi* [I am a Hebrew]" (1:9)! I am sincere in my worship in contrast to all pagans – illustrated by the sailors, and later by the Ninevites. At the same time, Jonah still remained in his rebellion against God; he still was an *avaryan* [sinner]. God allowed Jonah out of the fish to teach him a lesson, not because he had repented.

CHAPTER 3

Did Jonah obey God when he went to Nineveh? Radak assumes that he did. Malbim, in contrast, believes that Jonah rebelled even as he walked through the wicked city – he should have offered repentance as an option, instead of proclaiming the unqualified doom of the Ninevites. At any rate, Jonah's outburst in Chapter 4 demonstrates his continued disagreement with God over Nineveh's salvation.

The Ninevites, on the other hand, effected one of the greatest repentance movements in biblical history. The king of Nineveh even said what one might have expected Jonah to say: '*. . . Let everyone turn back from his evil ways and from the injustice of which he is guilty. Who knows but that God may turn and relent? He may turn back from His wrath, so that we do not perish*' (3:8-9). We noted above that the same contrast may be said of the captain of the ship, who sounded like a prophet while Jonah rebelled against God.

Nineveh's repentance amazes the reader, but it did not impress Jonah. Abarbanel and Malbim (on 4:1-2) suggest that Jonah was outraged that God spared the Ninevites after their repentance of social crimes, since they remained pagans. This interpretation seems to lie close to the heart of our Book: Jonah did not care about the outstandingly ethical behavior of the sailors nor the impressively penitent Ninevites. Thus, Jonah still was the *Ivri* he proclaimed himself to be in 1:9, sharply contrasting himself with the pagans of he encountered, and remaining distanced from the God he knew would have compassion on them.¹³

CHAPTER 4

This displeased Jonah greatly, and he was grieved. He prayed to the Lord, saying, 'O Lord! Isn't this just what I said when I was still in my own country? That is why I fled beforehand to Tarshish. For I know that You are a compassionate and gracious God, slow to anger, abounding in kindness, renouncing punishment. Please, Lord, take my life, for I would rather die than live' (4:1-3).

Outraged by God's sparing of Nineveh, Jonah revealed that he had fled initially because he knew that God would not punish the Ninevites. In his protest, Jonah appealed to God's attributes of mercy, but with a significant deviation from the classical formula in the aftermath of the Golden Calf:

The Lord! The Lord! A God compassionate and gracious, slow to anger, abounding in kindness and faithfulness . . . (Ex. 34:6).

For I know that You are a compassionate and gracious God, slow to anger, abounding in kindness, renouncing punishment (Jon. 4:2).¹⁴

Jonah substituted "renouncing punishment [*ve-niham al ha-ra'ah*]" for "faithfulness [*ve-emet*]." Jonah's God of truth would not spare pagans, yet God Himself had charged Jonah with a mission to save pagans! Thus, God's prophecy at the outset of the narrative challenged Jonah's very conception of God. He was so tortured by this conflict that he wanted to die. Ironically, then, Jonah's profound fear and love of God are what caused him to flee initially, and to demand that God take his life.

In his discussion of the literary significance of the sailors and Ninevites being pagan, Uriel Simon contends that this prominent element of the narrative simply casts an additional layer of embarrassment onto the Hebrew hero who is fleeing from God.¹⁵ From what we have seen, however, it is evident that the pagan identity of the characters is far more central to the theme of the Book.¹⁶

God demonstrated Jonah's willingness to die not only from idealistic motives, but also from causes stemming from discomfort:

'O Lord! Isn't this just what I said when I was still in my own country? That is why I fled beforehand to Tarshish Please, Lord, take my life, for I would rather die than live.' The Lord replied, 'Are you that deeply grieved?' (4:1-4).

And when the sun rose, God provided a sultry east wind; the sun beat down on Jonah's head, and he became faint. He begged for death, saying, 'I would rather die than live.' Then God said to Jonah, 'Are you so deeply grieved about the plant?' 'Yes,' he replied, 'so deeply that I want to die' (4:8-9).

God added a surprising variable when explaining His sparing of the Ninevites. While it had seemed from Chapter 3 that the Ninevites had saved themselves with their repentance, God suddenly offered a different reason:

Then the Lord said: 'You cared about the plant, which you did not work for and which you did not grow, which appeared overnight and perished overnight. And should I not care about Nineveh, that great city, in which there are more than a hundred and twenty thousand persons who do not yet know their right hand from their left, and many beasts as well!' (4:10-11).

Addressing this discrepancy, Uriel Simon suggests that only *some* of Nineveh's inhabitants could not tell their right from their left, probably referring to the children of Nineveh.¹⁷ However, the smooth reading of the text – that God referred to the entire city of Nineveh – points to a different resolution: God had been willing to destroy the Ninevites for their immorality, but forgave them once they repented. Although the Ninevites had misguided beliefs, God had compassion on them without requiring that they become monotheists. After all, they could not distinguish their right from their left. Jonah, however, echoed Abraham's belief: *'Shall not the Judge of all the earth deal justly?'* (Gen. 18:25). For Jonah, true justice required punishing even the penitent Ninevites, because they still were pagans.

To paraphrase God's response in Chapter 4: You, Jonah, wanted to die for the highest of ideals. However, you also were willing to die rather than face heat. Your human limitations are now fully exposed. How, then, can you expect to understand God's attributes?¹⁸ In the Book of Jonah, God shows that He has little patience for human immorality, but He can tolerate moral people with misguided beliefs. Jonah's stark silence at the end of the Book reflects his apprehension of the gulf between God and himself. He remained an "Ivri" to the very end.

CONCLUSIONS

The story of Jonah is about prophecy, the pinnacle of love of God, and the highest human spiritual achievement. But prophecy also causes increased anguish, as the prophet apprehends the infinite gap between God and humanity more intensely than anyone else. Jonah's spiritual attainments obviously still were far superior to those of the sailors or the people of Nineveh – he most certainly could tell his right hand from his left. The closer he came to God, the more he simultaneously gained clarity and recognition of how little he truly knew of God's ways. This realization tortured him to the point of death.

God taught Jonah that he did not need to wish for death. He had influenced others for the better, and attained a deeper level of understanding of God and of his own place in this world. Despite his passionate commitment to God, Jonah had to learn to appreciate moral people and to bring them guidance. He had a vital role to play in allowing God's mercy to be manifest.

Thus, the Book of Jonah is a larger-than-life story of every God-fearing individual who seeks closeness with the Infinite God. There is a paradoxical recognition that the closer one comes to God, the more one becomes conscious of the infinite gap separating God's wisdom from our own. There is a further paradox in being absolutely committed to God and Truth, while still respecting moral people of different beliefs. A midrash places one final line in Jonah's mouth: "Conduct Your world according to the attribute of mercy!"¹⁹ The midrash pinpoints the humbling lesson Jonah should have learned from this remarkable episode, and that every reader must learn.

NOTES

1. See, for example, *Mekhilta Bo*, J.T. *Sanhedrin* 11:5, *Pesachim* 87b, cited by Rashi, Kara, Ibn Ezra, and Radak.
2. *Pirkei D'Rabbi Eliezer* 9, cited by R. Saadyah (*Emunot ve-De'ot* 3:5), Rashi, Kara, Radak, and R. Isaiah of Trani.
3. See further discussion and critique of the aforementioned views in U. Simon, *The JPS Bible Commentary: Jonah* (Philadelphia: The Jewish Publication Society, 1999) introduction to commentary, pp. 7-12.
4. Y. Bachrach, *Jonah son of Amitai and Elijah: Teaching the Book of Jonah According to Traditional Sources* [Hebrew] (Jerusalem: The Religious Department of the Youth and Pioneering Division of the Zionist Organization, 1967) p. 51.
5. E. Ben-Menahem, *Da'at Mikra, Trei Asar* vol. 1 [Hebrew] (Jerusalem: Mossad HaRav Kook, 1973), *Jonah*, introduction to commentary, pp. 7-9.
6. Simon, introduction to commentary, pp. 12-13.

7. Ibid., introduction to commentary. pp. 33-35; commentary pp. 15-17.
8. See further elaboration of this critique in D. Henshke, "The Meaning of the Book of Jonah and Its Relationship to Yom Kippur" [Hebrew], *Megadim* 29 (1998) pp. 77-78.
9. See, e.g., Genesis 39:14, 17; 40:15; 41:12; 43:32; Exodus 1:15, 16, 19; 2:7, 11, 13; 3:18; 5:3; 7:16; 9:1, 13; 10:3.
10. Ben-Menahem, pp. 6-7. In his introduction to the commentary, pp. 3-4, Ben-Menahem adds that Chapter 1 is arranged chiasmatically, and Jonah's proclamation in v. 9 lies at the center of that structure, further highlighting its centrality to the chapter.
11. Cf. Rashi, Kara, and R. Eliezer of Beaugency. Even Ibn Ezra, Abarbanel, and Malbim, who assert that Jonah had agreed to go to Nineveh, agree that Jonah was unhappy about this concession.
12. Ibn Ezra counters that Jonah specifically stayed near Nineveh, so that he would be ready to go with a second command. Alternatively, Ben-Menahem, p. 13, suggests that Jonah might have thought that God had sent someone else.
13. The Book of Job achieves the same philosophical purpose by portraying Job as absolutely perfect and blameless in every regard. Cf. Simon, introduction to commentary, p. 19.
14. For an elaborate analysis of the interrelationship between Joel, Jonah, and Exodus 34, see T. B. Dozeman, "Inner Biblical Interpretation of Yah-weh's Gracious and Compassionate Character," *JBL* 108 (1989) pp. 207-223.
15. Simon, introduction to commentary, p. 33.
16. Henshke, pp. 75-90, critiques Simon's view as well, but draws a different conclusion: Jonah objected to repentance from fear, rather than a more sincere repentance. According to Henshke, both the sailors and Ninevites prayed and repented merely as a survival tactic.
17. Simon, commentary, p. 47.
18. See further discussion in Bachrach, pp. 66-68.
19. *Midrash Jonah*, ed. Jellinek, p. 102, quoted in Simon, introduction to commentary, p. 12.

INSTRUCTIONS FOR AUTHORS

Detailed *Instructions for Authors* and journal style can be found on our Internet website:
<http://www.jewishbible.org>

We welcome articles on the following books of Tanakh: Kings, Isaiah, Jeremiah, Micah, Amos, Joel, Haggai, Habakkuk, Psalms, Proverbs, Chronicles.